



64. *Vertumnus appears to Pomona in the guise of a herdsman*, tapestry in a set of the *Story of Vertumnus and Pomona*. Design attributed to Pieter Coecke van Aelst. c.1544. Probably woven under the direction of Willem de Panemaker, Brussels, between c.1548 and 1575. Wool, silk and silver- and silver-gilt-metal-wrapped threads, 420 by 494 cm. (Patrimonio Nacional, Madrid; exh. Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York).

Flemish, not hesitating to correct Serlio with his own ideas when he deemed it appropriate. Several of Coecke's publications, registers of his entrepreneurship as well as his commitment to advancing modern design principles, were exhibited in the room with his late *Vertumnus and Pomona* series (Fig.64). These brilliant Arcadian fantasies, filled with Renaissance pergolas and loggias, caryatids and cartouches, were some of his most enduringly popular works: woven again and again until well into the seventeenth century, they established a taste for garden tapestries that replaced medieval hunting scenes as the preferred textile landscapes on the walls of the mighty and wealthy. The scenes put architecture and ornament into play with natural forms and romantic narrative, intertwining nature and artifice in a manner reminiscent of the Nautilus cup design but on a grand scale. Statues seem alive; framing elements emerge from vegetal forms; cartouches weave into both encircling border and interior architecture. The play between reality and feigning, and the sense of multiple media evoked within each fanciful fictive ensemble are reminiscent of Rosso Fiorentino's Gallery of Francis I at Fontainebleau. The *Vertumnus* tapestries thus, on every level, situate Coecke at the forefront of design in mid-sixteenth-century northern Europe.

The exhibition is an amazing, at times overwhelming, display of Coecke's ingenuity.

While the catalogue separates out media so that curators in different departments could write about their specialities, the show does an excellent job of integrating Coecke's forays into different arts in roughly chronological groupings, highlighting what is novel and exciting about the effects he is inventing at each period. Visitors should also check out the subsidiary and rather hidden exhibition *Examining Opulence*, in which a set of Renaissance tapestry cushions is used as a vehicle to explain the intricate secrets of master weavers. Who knew that a great weaver could manipulate the twist of the thread to produce expressive effects apart from those delineated by the designer? This helps to explain why it took a single weaver two months to complete a square metre of a tapestry. This material deserved more attention and, in a design show where process is so critical, more could have been done with digital media to present the transformation of *petit patron* into cartoon into tapestry, highlighting the work that lay between initial design and final product. Yet that is to ask for even more richness in what is already a grand display.

¹ Catalogue: *Grand Design. Pieter Coecke van Aelst and Renaissance Tapestry*. Edited by Elizabeth A.H. Cleland. 412 pp. incl. 350 col. ill. (Yale University Press, New Haven and London, 2014), \$75. ISBN 978-0-300-20805-4.

Spanish drawings from Hamburg

Dallas and Madrid

by ZAHIRA VÉLIZ

SINCE 1891 THE Hamburger Kunsthalle has been custodian of one of the most important collections of Spanish drawings beyond Spain's borders. This has now been fully catalogued by leading scholars, and a substantial selection is exhibited in *The Spanish Gesture: Spanish Drawing from Murillo to Goya*, seen by this reviewer at the Meadows Museum, Dallas (closed 31st August), and currently on show at the Museo Nacional del Prado, Madrid (to 8th February).¹

The drawings were catalogued by Jens Hoffmann-Samland, with additional entries by specialist curators from the Prado. Eighty-six of the 210 drawings listed in the catalogue were selected for the exhibition, and these represent many fine sheets by some of Spain's defining artists: Alonso Cano, Francisco de Herrera the Elder and the Younger, Juan de Valdés Leal, Bartolomé Esteban Murillo, Francisco de Goya and Salvador Maella.

The Kunsthalle drawings are predominantly Andalusian, and the introductory catalogue essay² traces the probable origin of the collection to Francisco de Bruna y Ahumada (1719–1807), founder of the Academia de las



65. *Catherine of Alexandria altarpiece with two variant frames*, by Alonso Cano. c.1648–52. Pen and wash, brown ink over preliminary drawing in black pencil, stylus marks on laid paper, 33.4 by 19.1 cm. (Kupferstichkabinett, Kunsthalle, Hamburg; exh. Museo Nacional del Prado, Madrid).

Tres Artes Nobles in Seville, a jurist, bibliophile and connoisseur who was influential in the city's cultural life in the Age of Enlightenment. Around 1819 Bruna's drawings, by then in the hands of Joaquín Cortés (1776–1835), director of the Academia, were listed in an inventory written by José Atanasio Echeverría (1773/74–after 1819), and this key manuscript was identified in the Hamburger Kunsthalle archive in the course of research for the exhibition. It confirms that the collection was kept largely intact throughout the nineteenth century, passing, like other collections of Spanish drawings that left Spain, through the hands of Julian Benjamin Williams (c.1800–after 1866), the British consul in Seville, known for his expertise and taste, and finally appearing in the inventory of the London book dealer Bernard Quaritch Ltd in 1890, from whom the Hamburger Kunsthalle acquired the drawings in 1891. Since then, selected drawings have been shown in minor displays in 1931, 1966 and 2005, but the current exhibition is the most comprehensive presentation to date. The exhibition and its catalogue constitute a major contribution to the subject.

Although the provenance of the collection can be firmly traced only to the early nineteenth century, there is strong evidence that the collection was assembled in Seville in the first half of the eighteenth century and was intended to illustrate the city's artistic history. The nucleus of the collection, according to Bruna's description in 1778, would appear to have been 'a folio with a number of signed original drawings that were produced in this [Seville] school, and another (with drawings) of the most famous masters of Seville, Spain and even Italy, compiled by Murillo' (p.20). According to Echeverría's inventory, the drawings were selected to illustrate the periods when training in art was a matter of pride for Seville, with a smaller representation of the work of academic and court artists from Madrid. Drawings by and after Goya from the collection of J.A. Ceán Bermúdez (1749–1829) were added to the portfolio at some point before the inventory was made around 1819. Ceán Bermúdez was an assiduous collector who played an important role in the transmission of ideas and works of art between Madrid and Seville. It was probably while the collection was in Williams's possession, perhaps still kept as loose sheets in a portfolio, that additions and subtractions were made.³

The core of the collection has survived intact, and the current exhibition provides a rare opportunity to view drawings that stand at the heart of the corpus of several major Spanish artists. There are some splendid sheets by Cano (*Catherine of Alexandria altarpiece with two variant frames*; cat. no.9; Fig.65), Antonio del Castillo (*David and Goliath*; no.22), Murillo (the *Assumption of the Virgin*; no.112) and Goya (*Couple with parasol on the boulevard*; no.61), some of which have appeared in monographic exhibitions of work by these artists in recent years. The



66. *Standing draped figure facing right, his hands joined*, attributed to the circle of Francisco de Zurbarán. Early seventeenth century. Black chalk on blue prepared laid paper, 19.9 by 13.4 cm. (Kupferstichkabinett, Kunsthalle, Hamburg; exh. Museo Nacional del Prado, Madrid).

drawings of slightly lesser-known figures such as Herrera the Younger (*Nobleman in a landscape*; no.91), Valdés Leal (*The head of St John the Baptist*; no.165) or Jerónimo Bobadilla (*St Joseph, standing, with the Christ Child on his arm*; no.4) reveal personalities of distinction and refinement, and one can only hope that this opportunity for close study will lead to the construction of rigorous *œuvres* for these artists. Other drawings by hitherto little-known draughtsmen from Seville include José Antolínez's *Angel with arms crossed over her breast* (no.2.) and *Christ bearing the Cross* (no.159), convincingly attributed to Clemente Fernández de Torres. There are also numerous drawings central to the *œuvre* of Cornelio Schut, that stalwart of Murillo's academy and faithful perpetuator of his master's style. Perhaps the most intriguing relationship to be explored in the exhibition is that of the father and son Herrera the Elder and the Younger. The series of half- or three-quarter-length apostles by each may be juxtaposed: Herrera the Elder's series is complete, and executed in bold chiaroscuro wash that attests to his mastery of brush-drawing technique (nos.71–82). The two sheets of apostles by Herrera the Younger (*St Matthias* and *St Peter*; nos.88–89) are executed in the emphatic hatching characteristic of the Seville school, modified by this artist with a decisive yet staccato touch and the almost whimsical calligraphic flourishes peculiar to him. It is

conjectured that the original function of Herrera the Elder's drawings may have been didactic, perhaps as an exercise for his pupils in understanding the importance of tone, light and shadow in drawing and composition. Might such a series of drawings be intended to serve as a copying exercise for trainee artists? Iconographical attributes are marginal, and it is the figures' psychological and spiritual state that is conveyed through the chiaroscuro. Herrera the Younger's figures also convey psychological intensity, but differ greatly in form and execution: here the subject's spiritual energy is expressed through a complex relationship between figure and ground, pose, gesture and gaze.

Among Sevillian draughtsmen, Francisco de Zurbarán is the most elusive. The Hamburg collection includes sheets of monk-like figures that have long been identified with Zurbarán and his circle, and the drawing on blue paper, *Standing draped figure facing right, his hands joined* (no.179; Fig.66) conveys the gravity of mood typical of this master. All the sheets given to 'Circle of Francisco de Zurbarán' in the catalogue betray an interest in the geometrical structure of draperies consistent with Zurbarán's aesthetic formulae.

Artists whose drawings were added to the seventeenth-century core by subsequent owners of the collection include Domingo Martínez (nos.102 and 103) and Pablo Pernicharo (no.129), which reveal a remarkable range of techniques and functions. Addi-



67. *Francisco Lezcano, 'The child from Vallecas'*, by Francisco de Goya after Diego Velázquez. 1778/79–1785; before 1792. Red chalk over graphite on laid paper, 20.2 by 15.7 cm. (Kupferstichkabinett, Kunsthalle, Hamburg; exh. Museo Nacional del Prado, Madrid).

tionally, the collection includes numerous drawings that may be seen as examples of technical process, such as Valdés Leal's study of *St Catherine* (no.166). Many sheets provide a glimpse into the development of compositional ideas, such as *Christ with various head studies and a hand study* (no.95) by Herrera the Younger, or Murillo's idea sketch *Study for Mary Magdalene sleeping on Christ's empty tomb* (no.111). Another group of drawings relate to printmaking: the series by Goya after works by Diego Velázquez were preparatory to etchings (Fig.67); *St Dominic in Soriano* (no.8), attributed to Cano, is closely related to a print by Diego Obregón after Cano's painting of the subject. Highly finished compositional drawings such as those by Jerónimo Bobadilla (nos.4 and 5) or Juan de Valdés Leal (nos.168 and 170) reveal the squaring lines used to enlarge the designs for painting on panel or canvas.

For each of the exhibited drawings, the catalogue contains a large illustration and a relatively detailed entry. There is also an illustrated alphabetical listing of all 210 drawings. Specialists may find reason to quibble with some attributions, and it is an inevitable difficulty that the well-known, firmly attributed drawings are straightforward to catalogue, while identifying the function, subject, author and even period for minor, previously uncatalogued sheets is often extremely challenging.

Some unevenness is therefore unavoidable, and a systematic documentation of watermarks would have been useful. Despite these minor weaknesses, the catalogue and exhibition open the way for an understanding of these Spanish masters' draughtsmanship and technique, as well as providing evidence for the collection's origins and history.

¹ The exhibition was supported by the Centro de Estudios de Europa Hispánica – Center for Spain in America – in collaboration with the Hamburger Kunsthalle, the Meadows Museum and the Museo Nacional del Prado, Madrid.

² Catalogue: *The Spanish Gesture: Drawings from Murillo to Goya in the Hamburger Kunsthalle*. Edited by Jens Hoffmann-Samland, with contributions by María Cruz de Carlos Varona, Gabriele Finaldi, José Manuel Matilla, Manuela B. Mena Marqués, Gloria Solache and Annemarie Stefes. 291 pp. incl. 236 col. ills. (Meadows Museum, Dallas, Museo del Prado, Madrid, and Kunsthalle, Hamburg, 2014), \$75. ISBN 978-0-692-20786-4. Spanish edition: *Dibujos españoles en la Kunsthalle de Hamburgo* (Ediciones El Viso, Madrid, 2014), 978-8-484-80285-3.

³ Williams sold or gave drawings to Richard Ford, as well as to Frank Hall Standish, who bequeathed his collection to Louis Philippe of France; all of the drawings from Louis Philippe's collection were subsequently sold in London in 1853, and dispersed among various collections being formed at that time, such as those of William Stirling Maxwell, Paul Lefort and Valentín Carderera.

Unsettled landscapes

Santa Fe

by ROBERT SILBERMAN

BEGINNING IN 1995, SITE Santa Fe presented a series of international biennials. These have featured 'celebrity' curators such as Dave Hickey and Robert Storr, and A-list artists including Marina Abramović, Jenny Holzer, Anish Kapoor and Kara Walker, as well as a few with local and regional ties such as Ken Price. The 2010 biennial, which emphasised animation, was excellent but perhaps too tangential in relation to contemporary art. In any event, faced with the problem of standing out in the now-crowded field of biennials around the world, SITE decided to reconsider its programme.

The result is *SITELines: New Perspectives on Art of the Americas*, with the initiative of looking 'to geography as a structural framework, to the history of New Mexico as inspiration, and to the Americas as a vast territory for exploration'. *Unsettled Landscapes* (to 11th January)¹ is the first exhibition in a planned series of three, with curatorial teams and long-term artist residencies introduced as a response to concerns about drop-in curators and artists, as well as difficulties with projects involving the local community. In theory, the new approach sounds fine, but in practice, it is not so good.

The inaugural exhibition, as its title suggests, has landscape as its theme. The curators took their lead in part from W.T.J. Mitchell's book *Landscape and Power* (1994), and the presentation employs enough fashionable jargon for more than one graduate seminar. A wall label describes Daniel Joseph Martinez as a conceptualist who 'has focused his attention on deconstruction of the mechanisms by which hegemony structures our identity and desire'. The catalogue entry adds that he is a political artist who characterises his practice as 'a radical critique that seeks nothing short of [...] the wholesale eradication of the political and social apparatus of capitalism'. Martinez's *She could see Russia from her house . . .*' consists of postcards he sent from Alaska viewed via reflections in distorting mirrors. It is a lively mash-up of mail art, performance (he travelled the length of an oil pipeline) and installation, but the disconnection between the rhetoric and the reality is a problem, and one not limited to that work alone.

Another problem is that the exhibition includes works by living artists and dead ones, recent works and others from as far back as the 1970s, without bothering to provide an explanation. A 1974 Frank Gohlke photograph made in Albuquerque adds a local touch to the problem of water resources but comes across as an inadequate effort to introduce the radical shift in landscape photography and art marked a year later by the New Topographics exhibition of 1975. Agnes Denes's great 1982 environmental work *Wheatfield*, created on